



## DECISION RECORD

<b>Service Reference Number</b>	MP&I-2025-063																																	
<b>Decision Maker</b>	Gill Osgerby, Interim Assistant Director, Major Projects & Infrastructure																																	
<b>Delegated Authority</b>	Officer exercising delegated powers pursuant to Minute 110 (c) of the Cabinet meeting 25 March 2024																																	
<b>Decision:</b>	To award a contract to M.B Roche and Sons Limited the West Carr (Housing) Footpath Improvement scheme which includes footpath resurfacing and reconstruction on Kingscott Close, Cookbury Close, Ashworthy Close, Padstow Close and Malpas Close for the value of £191,803.00.																																	
<b>Reasons for the Decision:</b>	<p>The Authority has conducted a competitive procurement exercise via Open Tender from the 9<sup>th</sup> January 2025 to the 12<sup>th</sup> February 2025 with 5 compliant submissions received.</p> <p>Following evaluation and moderation the bid submitted by M.B Roche and Sons Limited represented the best value for money, meeting the published criteria of requirements, timescales, and is within budget. The table below shows the scores allocated. Evaluation was on the basis of:</p> <p>70% Price 30% Quality/technical</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Company</th> <th>Quality Score</th> <th>Price Score</th> <th>Total Score</th> <th>Rank</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>M.B Roche &amp; Sons Limited</td> <td>26.0</td> <td>70.0</td> <td>96.0</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Supplier B</td> <td>24.0</td> <td>67.2</td> <td>91.2</td> <td>2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Supplier C</td> <td>23.8</td> <td>54.6</td> <td>78.4</td> <td>3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Supplier D</td> <td>20.2</td> <td>54.2</td> <td>74.4</td> <td>4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Supplier E</td> <td>25.8</td> <td>52.4</td> <td>78.2</td> <td>5</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>				Company	Quality Score	Price Score	Total Score	Rank	M.B Roche & Sons Limited	26.0	70.0	96.0	1	Supplier B	24.0	67.2	91.2	2	Supplier C	23.8	54.6	78.4	3	Supplier D	20.2	54.2	74.4	4	Supplier E	25.8	52.4	78.2	5
Company	Quality Score	Price Score	Total Score	Rank																														
M.B Roche & Sons Limited	26.0	70.0	96.0	1																														
Supplier B	24.0	67.2	91.2	2																														
Supplier C	23.8	54.6	78.4	3																														
Supplier D	20.2	54.2	74.4	4																														
Supplier E	25.8	52.4	78.2	5																														

**Exemptions**

Is the accompanying formal report (or other documentation where applicable) exempt?

**Yes**

***Appendix A is exempt.***

Appendix A to the Decision Record is exempt in that it contains information relating to the financial and business affairs of bidders in a tender process and the public interest in retaining the confidence of bidders in the confidentiality of the tender process outweighs the public interest in releasing such information.

**Background and Supporting information:**

Tender submissions were sought from those suppliers through the YORtender Mercell Procurement portal using the Open Tender procurement process for the West Carr (Housing) Footpath Improvement scheme.

The price / quality criteria for the tender were set at 70% price / 30% quality. Social value outcomes were a contractual requirement inserted at framework tender stage. This scheme is to carry out essential footpath resurfacing, and reconstruction works on Kingscott Close, Cookbury Close, Ashworthy Close, Padstow Close and Malpas Close.

Five acceptable bids were received in response to the further competition.

The submission from M.B Roche and Sons Limited, was evaluated to be most economically advantageous tender, which indicates that the same represents the best value. The West Carr (Housing) Footpath Improvement scheme is to be funded by the Housing Capital Programme.

**Equalities Impact Information:**

Does the decision have relevance to equality or affect any group with protected characteristics?

- These improvements to existing carriageway surface will have a positive impact for all age groups and users.
- An EIA has been completed and signed by the Disability Access Officer

**YES**

**Contact Officer:** Lewis Egan – 01482 612132 - (Lewis.Egan@hullcc.gov.uk)

**Chief Officer Comments**

Comments of the Assistant Director of Legal Services and Governance (Monitoring Officer)

The Council has a duty to maintain the adopted public highway under section 41 Highways Act 1980. In order to discharge that duty in relation to the footpaths within the

West area of Hull, the Council conducted an open procurement process consistent both with the Public Contracts Regulations 2015 and the Council's Contract Procedure Rules. Through that process, M.B Roche and Sons Limited were evaluated as having submitted the most economically advantageous tender which indicates best value as required by section 3 Local Government Act 1999. [BC]

Comments of the Director of Finance and Transformation (Section 151 Officer)

The Director of Finance and Transformation confirms a budget provision is available in the HRA capital programme under external planned works (SC)

Comments of the Assistant Director of Organisation Development & Human Resources and compliance with the equality act

The content of the report is noted. There are no staffing or equality issues arising for the council from this decision. KH

Comments of the Portfolio Holder for Transportation, Roads and Highways

I fully support this decision. The improvements to the footpaths in these streets will mean safer and more accessible pavements for the residents in that area. MI

Scrutiny Comments

This decision has not been subject to pre-decision scrutiny. Ref: Sc8644 [MK].

**Exceptional Circumstances**

Is the decision record currently exempt from publication at the point of decision?

**No**

If yes, what date can the decision record be made public?

Reason the decision record is exempt from publication at the point of decision:

**Signature of Decision Maker:**

Signed: Signature confirmed

Date signed: **21/03/2025**

**FOR COMPLETION BY THE SCRUTINY OFFICE:**

Date published on CMIS:

**24/03/2025**

Can the decision be called in?

**No**

Date decision comes into force

**24/03/2025**