

DECISION RECORD

Service Reference Number	DCE/SS/2016/016
Decision Maker Andy Burton (City Streetscene Manager) in Consultation with the Town Clerk.	
Delegated Authority Officer exercising delegated powers pursuant to Paragraph 17.5 of Part B of the Constitution.	
Decision:	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. That contracts are awarded to East Yorkshire Motor Services Ltd as the successful tenderer for Lots 1, 2, 4 & 5 at a total annual cost of £169,863.04 per annum. 2. The contract duration will be for the period 30 October 2016 to 31 October 2019, with the option to extend each Lot for up to 12 months. 3. That no contract is awarded for Lot 3. 4. That officers engage with bus companies to finalise agreements to serve the Grammar School Rd and Kestrel Avenue areas. 5. That support for subsidised services procured by North Lincolnshire and East Riding of Yorkshire Councils be terminated from 1st April 2017. 	
Summary of the Decision:	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. That the award of lots 1, 2,4 and 5 are in line with the savings targets approved by Cabinet on 23 May 2016, Minute 146. 2. That the most economically advantageous tender was received from East Yorkshire Motor Services based on the tender lot variation and evaluation criteria, 80% price and 20% quality. 3. That the recommended Supplier's proposal will include a variation of the existing service which consists of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lot 1, Variation 1 - Sibelius Road to City Centre Lot 2, Variation 1 - Mizzen Road to City Centre Lot 4, Variation 2 - Victoria Dock to City Centre Lot 5, Variation 2 - Broadway Drive to City Centre 4. The vehicle enhancements offered in the bid submissions contribute towards offering easy access to shops and employment within the city which may otherwise not be possible. 	

5. The proposal includes for the use of vehicles Euro 3 or greater that assist with reduction of the Carbon Footprint.

Exemptions

Is the accompanying formal report (or other documentation where applicable) exempt? **Yes**

Reason the report (or other documentation) is exempt: **This item is not exempt, however, the Appendices (2, 3, 4 & 5) to this report are exempt from publication because it contains information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information) namely the details of tenders submitted to the authority by competing suppliers and the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighs the public interest in publication as publishing the detail of unsuccessful bids which were submitted in confidence is likely to discourage bidders from tendering.**

Supporting information:

Formal Report attached

Chief Officer Comments

Comments of the Town Clerk (Monitoring Officer)

The Council are subject to a general duty to make arrangements to secure continuous improvements in the way functions are exercised, having regard to a combination of economy, efficiency and effectiveness. Under the Public Services (Social Value) Act 2012 the wider parameters of that duty in terms of Social Value are made explicit requiring the Council to consider:

- How what is procured may improve the economic, social and environmental well-being of the area
- How in conducting the process of procurement the Council might act with a view to securing that improvement

The required services have been procured in accordance with EU Procurement Law with pre-tender consultation that has informed the specification of the service and a focus upon quality of delivery. The focus on quality, and the division of the tender into lots with a requirement for social value is consistent with those criteria. The proposal from the identified tenderer appears therefore to meet the Best Value duty.

Comments of the Section 151 Officer

The need to balance savings achievable against reductions in service provision (and consequent public opposition) is understood, and it is recognized that the proposed option will secure the savings required by the MTFs. From a purely financial perspective however the potential that further savings might be possible is a factor that merits additional exploration.

Comments of the City HR Manager

There are no staffing or wider human resources implications identified in the report.

Comments of the Portfolio Holder for For Energy City

Whilst recognising these changes may cause some difficulties for residents the extensive consultation undertaken has resulted in contracts being awarded that will provide a service for the majority of passengers.

Scrutiny Comments

This report has not been subject to scrutiny. However, the original report “Provision of Supported Bus Services” which sought authority to undertake a tender exercise for the provision of the supported bus services was considered by the Finance and Value for Money Overview and Scrutiny Commission at its meeting on Friday, 13 May, 2016. The Commission agreed the following recommendations:

- a) That, as the bus services being put out to tender are essential services for some residents and changes to the services could have a major impact on the lives of those residents, the Commission wishes to ensure that the outcome of the tender exercise is subject to scrutiny prior to the award of contracts.
- b) Officers are requested to consider how scrutiny of the planned services can be factored into the Tender Timetable in advance of the contract award, and that the officer proposals are reported to the Chair of this Commission prior to being discussed with the Chair of OSMC with a view to the proposed new services being referred by OSMC to the Energy and Infrastructure OSC for pre contract award scrutiny.

It is unfortunate that the timescales associated with the tender process and award of contract have resulted in pre-contract award scrutiny not taking place. However, it is understood that a briefing is to be circulated to all Members advising of the outcome of the tender exercise.

The original report “Provision of Supported Bus Services” was also considered on an informal basis by the Energy and Infrastructure Overview and Scrutiny Commission at its meeting of Wednesday, 13 July 2016. The Commission raised concerns that the report had been considered by the Finance and Value for Money OSC when bus travel fell within the remit of the Energy and Infrastructure OSC; that there had not been more advance warning of the consultation that had taken place with service users; and, that the list of affected Wards included in the report was incomplete.

Exceptional Circumstances NA

Is the decision record currently exempt from publication at the point of decision?	No
--	-----------

If yes, what date can the decision record be made public?	
---	--

Reason the decision record is exempt from publication at the point of decision:

Signature of Decision Maker:

Signed:**Signature Confirmed**
(A.Burton).....

Date signed:1st September 2016.....

FOR COMPLETION BY THE SCRUTINY OFFICE:	
Date published on CMIS:	...05.09.16..... ...
Can the decision be called in?	No
Date decision comes into force:	... 05.09.16.....

Please ensure all relevant sections are completed as the documentation will be returned if not.

Further guidance on decision making can be found in the following documents:

- GUIDANCE FOR COMPLETION OF DECISION RECORD FORMS
- DECISION RECORDS GUIDANCE
- DECISION MAKING GUIDANCE
- DECISION MAKING PROCESS

Any queries should be sent to the Decision Records inbox: DecisionRecords@hullcc.gov.uk

PUBLICATION OF THE DECISION RECORD

Once this form is completed the following electronic documents must be logged with the Scrutiny Office, via the Decision Records inbox: DecisionRecords@hullcc.gov.uk to enable the decision to be published on-line:

1. A **PDF** version of the completed decision record **including** the decision maker's signature (*the original signed version should be retained for reference within the relevant service area*)
2. An unsigned **Word** version of the completed decision record for completion by the scrutiny office.
3. A copy of the formal report plus any supporting documentation (if applicable).

The Scrutiny Office will endeavour to ensure decision records submitted before 3.00pm are published the following day. All decision records are held overnight in order to ensure the press office are aware of upcoming decisions.

Please do not contact individual Scrutiny Officers as the generic mail box will take into account leave etc. If decision records or reports are incomplete or contain errors they will be returned so the necessary amendments can be made.

All published decision records can be accessed on CMIS using the following link:

<https://cmis.hullcc.gov.uk/cmis/Decisions.aspx>